

POLARIZATION

WHAT EVERYONE NEEDS TO KNOW®

NOLAN McCARTY

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and certain other countries.

"What Everyone Needs to Know" is a registered trademark of
Oxford University Press.

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America.

© Oxford University Press 2019

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by license, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reproduction rights organization. Inquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above.

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: McCarty, Nolan, author.

Title: Polarization : what everyone needs to know / Nolan McCarty.

Description: New York, NY : Oxford University Press, 2019. |

Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018058213 | ISBN 9780190867782 (hardcover) |

ISBN 9780190867775 (paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: Political culture—United States. |

Polarization (Social sciences)—Political aspects—United States. |

Social structure—United States. | BISAC: POLITICAL SCIENCE / General. |

POLITICAL SCIENCE / History & Theory.

Classification: LCC JK1726 .M399 2019 | DDC 306.20973—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018058213>

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xiii
1 Introduction	1
2 What Is Political Polarization?	8
2.1 <i>What is the difference between partisanship and polarization?</i>	12
2.2 <i>What is the difference between mass and elite polarization?</i>	13
2.3 <i>What is partisan sorting and is it different from polarization?</i>	14
2.4 <i>What is belief constraint and ideological consistency?</i>	16
2.5 <i>Who is polarized—the public or the politicians?</i>	17
2.6 <i>Why is polarization bad?</i>	19
2.7 <i>What have we learned?</i>	21
3 Are Partisan Elites Polarized?	22
3.1 <i>How do we measure elite polarization?</i>	24
3.2 <i>Why do you assume legislative voting occurs only on the liberal-conservative dimension?</i>	32
3.3 <i>Are there other sources of data for measuring congressional polarization?</i>	34
3.4 <i>Do roll-call ideal points really reflect congressional ideology?</i>	38

3.5	<i>What issues divide Congress the most?</i>	41
3.6	<i>Are both parties responsible for polarization?</i>	42
3.7	<i>Are state legislatures polarized?</i>	44
3.8	<i>Are the courts polarized?</i>	47
3.9	<i>And the media?</i>	48
3.10	<i>What have we learned?</i>	49
4	Is the Public Polarized?	50
4.1	<i>How is it even plausible that the public is not polarized?</i>	51
4.2	<i>Is the public moderate?</i>	54
4.3	<i>What is the evidence in favor of increased voter sorting?</i>	55
4.4	<i>Why does it matter whether voters are sorted but not polarized?</i>	58
4.5	<i>Is sorting a good thing or a bad thing?</i>	58
4.6	<i>What issues are the public sorted on?</i>	59
4.7	<i>Is it the economy, stupid?</i>	60
4.8	<i>Does polarization reflect a "culture war"?</i>	60
4.9	<i>What is affective polarization?</i>	61
4.10	<i>What have we learned?</i>	67
5	What Are the Causes of Polarization?	69
5.1	<i>Why was polarization so low from the 1930s to the 1960s?</i>	70
5.2	<i>Can the polarization of the late nineteenth century be compared to what we see today?</i>	71
5.3	<i>What is the Southern Realignment and why did it happen?</i>	72
5.4	<i>Why did southern whites move to the GOP?</i>	75
5.5	<i>Why is congressional voting on racial issues no longer distinctive?</i>	78
5.6	<i>Does economic inequality cause polarization?</i>	78
5.7	<i>Do party leaders engineer polarization?</i>	81
5.8	<i>Is the rising competition for congressional majorities to blame?</i>	84
5.9	<i>Why don't more moderates run for Congress?</i>	86

5.10	<i>Is the media responsible for polarization?</i>	88
5.11	<i>What about the emergence of the Internet and social media?</i>	93
5.12	<i>Is the United States unique?</i>	98
5.13	<i>What have we learned?</i>	99

6 How Does Electoral Law Affect Legislative Polarization? 101

6.1	<i>How much does polarization reflect geographic sorting?</i>	101
6.2	<i>Does gerrymandering cause polarization?</i>	104
6.3	<i>Isn't it possible that the effects of gerrymandering on the House carried over to the Senate?</i>	108
6.4	<i>But isn't gerrymandering responsible for a decline in electoral competitiveness?</i>	108
6.5	<i>Are there other ways in which redistricting can impact polarization?</i>	112
6.6	<i>Do partisan primaries cause polarization?</i>	115
6.7	<i>Hasn't California's "Top-Two" system reduced polarization there?</i>	118
6.8	<i>What role does campaign finance play in polarization?</i>	119
6.9	<i>Would stronger parties reduce polarization?</i>	122
6.10	<i>Would a different electoral system reduce polarization?</i>	125
6.11	<i>What have we learned?</i>	132

7 What Are the Consequences of Polarization for Public Policy and Governance? 134

7.1	<i>Why does polarization impact congressional policymaking capacity?</i>	135
7.2	<i>How do legislative parties turn polarization into gridlock?</i>	136
7.3	<i>What about the filibuster and the presidential veto?</i>	138
7.4	<i>Does polarization make Congress less productive?</i>	140
7.5	<i>How has polarization affected the executive branch and the bureaucracy?</i>	141

<i>7.6 Has the American judiciary and legal system changed as a result of polarization?</i>	142
<i>7.7 How has polarization affected the balance of power between the national and state governments?</i>	145
<i>7.8 Has polarization affected policymaking in the states?</i>	147
<i>7.9 Has polarization increased the political power of the wealthy relative to others?</i>	149
<i>7.10 Does polarization have a conservative bias?</i>	153
<i>7.11 What have we learned?</i>	154

8 Is the Trump Presidency a New Normal or More of the Same? 156

APPENDIX A HOW ARE LEGISLATOR IDEAL POINTS ESTIMATED? 169

<i>A.1 What if the liberal-conservative dimension does not explain all voting?</i>	172
<i>A.2 Do members' ideal points move over time?</i>	173
<i>A.3 Can ideal points be compared over time?</i>	174
<i>A.4 Are there other methods for measuring ideal points and polarization from roll calls?</i>	175
<i>A.5 What are the limitations of the roll-call-based measures of polarization?</i>	177

APPENDIX B HOW DO WE MEASURE POLARIZATION IN THE PUBLIC? 181

<i>B.1 What is a survey?</i>	181
<i>B.2 What is a population and sample?</i>	182
<i>B.3 How do we draw inferences from surveys?</i>	183
<i>B.4 Why is random sampling important?</i>	184
<i>B.5 What happens when samples are not random?</i>	186
<i>B.6 What are some of the problems associated with the design of surveys?</i>	187

<i>B.7 What are some limitations of using surveys to measure polarization?</i>	190
<i>B.8 What is a survey experiment?</i>	192
<i>B.9 What are survey scales?</i>	195
<i>B.10 What is a thermometer rating?</i>	199
<i>B.11 What is party identification?</i>	199
<i>B.12 What is an independent?</i>	200
<i>B.13 What is ideological self-placement?</i>	202
<i>B.14 Can we estimate ideal points of voters?</i>	203
NOTES	207
BIBLIOGRAPHY	229
INDEX	253