

The Veil of Participation

CITIZENS AND POLITICAL PARTIES IN
CONSTITUTION-MAKING PROCESSES

ALEXANDER HUDSON

Max Planck Institute (Göttingen, Germany)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/97811088793513

DOI: 10.1017/9781108878685

© Alexander Hudson 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2021

First paperback edition 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

NAMES: Hudson, Alexander, author.

TITLE: The veil of participation : citizens and political parties in constitution-making processes / Alexander Hudson, Comparative Constitutionalism Fellow Group, Max Planck Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity.

DESCRIPTION: [New York] : [Cambridge University Press], 2021. | Series: CCLP comparative constitutional law and policy | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020047392 (print) | LCCN 2020047393 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108840071 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108793513 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108878685 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Constitutions. | Constitutional law | Political participation. | Political parties – Law and legislation. | Legislation – Citizen participation.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC K3165 .H783 2021 (print) | LCC K3165 (ebook) | DDC 342.02–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020047392>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020047393>

ISBN 978-1-108-84007-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-79351-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page xi</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	xii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 The Public Face of Constitution-Making	1
1.2 Why Is a Study of Participation Important?	3
1.3 What This Book Does	6
1.4 Outline of the Book	8
2 Theoretical Foundations of Participatory Drafting	12
2.1 Introduction	12
2.2 Party-Mediated Political Participation	12
2.3 Constitution-Making and Political Parties	14
2.4 Questions of Legitimacy and Efficacy	27
2.5 The Theory Revisited	36
3 South Africa: Party Domination	39
3.1 Introduction	39
3.2 Historical Background	41
3.3 Drafting the Final Constitution	49
3.4 Analysis of the Drafting Process	59
3.5 In the Words of the Drafters	65
3.6 The Constitutional Principles as a Limiting Factor	75
3.7 Conclusion	77
4 Brazil: Citizen Entrepreneurs	79
4.1 Introduction	79
4.2 Historical Background	81
4.3 The National Constituent Assembly	84

4.4	Popular Participation – Individuals	87
4.5	Popular Participation – Groups	97
4.6	Polling Data	103
4.7	In the Words of the Drafters	105
4.8	A Natural Experiment in Brazil: The Afonso Arinos Draft	108
4.9	Conclusion	111
5	Iceland: Citizen Drafters	113
5.1	Introduction	113
5.2	Impetus for Reform: Economic Crisis	114
5.3	The Drafting Process in Iceland	115
5.4	Measuring Participation	120
5.5	Data and Methods	120
5.6	Assessing the Impact of Participation	122
5.7	Statistical Analysis	127
5.8	Why Did the Drafters Give Effect to Proposals from the Public?	132
5.9	A Failed Constitutional Revolution?	134
5.10	Conclusion	136
6	Cross-National Analysis	138
6.1	Introduction	138
6.2	Comprehensive Cross-National Analysis	139
6.3	Qualitative Assessment of Selected Cases	145
6.4	Conclusion	174
7	Public Participation in Constitution-Making Reconsidered	175
7.1	Introduction	175
7.2	Reviewing the Evidence	176
7.3	Broader Implications	178
7.4	Guidance for Constitution Makers	186
	<i>Appendices</i>	189
	<i>Bibliography</i>	198
	<i>Index</i>	219