

POPULIST CONSTITUTIONALISM AND ILLIBERAL DEMOCRACIES

Between Constitutional Imagination,
Normative Entrenchment and
Political Reality

Edited by
Martin BELOV



INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Mews
Wellington Street | Cambridge
CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1223 736 170
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and
Rest of the World (incl. Eastern Europe)*
NBN International
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD
United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe
Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV
Hoogstraat 139/6
1000 Brussels
Belgium
Tel: +32 (0)800 39 067
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada
Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

**Populist Constitutionalism and Illiberal Democracies. Between
Constitutional Imagination, Normative Entrenchment and Political Reality**
© The editor and contributors severally 2021

The editor and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: © EyeEm / Alamy Stock Photo

ISBN 978-1-83970-060-6
D/2021/7849/7
NUR 820

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Contributors</i>	xiii
-----------------------------------	------

Introduction

Martin BELOV	1
--------------------	---

PART I. REPUBLICAN CONSTITUTIONALISM: THE ROLE OF PEOPLE IN RADICAL DEMOCRACY

The People and the Lawgiver in Political Foundings

Eoin DALY	13
1. Introduction	13
2. The Incapacity of the People as a Founding Agent	14
3. The Moral Perils of Political Founding	15
4. Political Action and Natural Harmony	19
5. A Contrast with Robespierre's Political 'Melodrama'	24
6. Conclusion	29

Radical Democracy and Revolutionary Reform: Looking for Solutions in Times of Democratic Disruption

Marcin KILANOWSKI	31
1. Introduction	31
2. The People	33
3. Towards Civil Society	35
4. Education	39
5. Institutions	42
6. Concluding Remarks	44

PART II. REASSESSING CONSTITUTIONAL PRINCIPLES IN TIMES OF DEMOCRATIC RUPTURES

The Invisible Separation of Powers and the Control of the Central Political Power: Lessons from Hungary, Moldova and Romania

Zoltán POZSÁR-SZENTMIKLÓSY	49
1. Legal Institutions and Procedures Affecting the Separation of Powers	49
2. Theory and Practice	51
3. The Separation of Powers as a Complex System	52
4. Case Studies	59
5. Conclusions	75

Rule of Law vs. Democracy: With Special Regard to the Case of Hungary

Zoltán J. TOTH	77
1. Introduction	77
2. Meanings of the 'Rule of Law'	78
3. The Definition and the Content of Democracy	84
4. The Content Elements of Democracy	86
5. Democracy, the Rule of Law and the Constitutional Court's Practice	90

PART III. POPULIST CONSTITUTIONALISM: DEMOCRACY IN CRISIS

The Degeneration of Contemporary Democracies as a New Phenomenology of Constitutional Transition

Angela DI GREGORIO	101
1. Definitions and Methodological Problems	101
2. The Doctrine on Illiberal Constitutionalism and Democracy	103
3. The Degeneration of Contemporary Democracies as a New Phenomenology of Constitutional Transition	108
4. 'Degraded' Democracies as an Intermediate Hypothesis between Democracy and Authoritarianism	110

5. Crisis of Liberal Democracy and Various Meanings
of 'Democracy' and 'Constitutionalism' 112

Between Law and Revolution: Is Populism Constitutional?

- Gianmario DEMURO 117
1. Introduction. 117
 2. Populism vs. Constitutionalism and Parliamentary
Democracy. 121
 3. Populism as an Ideology Proliferates in Illiberal
Democracies 125
 4. Conclusion: European Constitutional Identity has to Limit
Populism within the Internal State 127

European Constitutional Order and Populist Legal Revolution: A Challenge for Western Liberal Democracies

- Carlo Alberto CIARALLI 129
1. The Rise of Populism in Europe 129
 2. European Technocratic Democracy and Populist Direct
Democracy. 133
 3. Populism as a 'Stress Test' for the European Legal Order 137
 4. Italy as a Peculiar Case Study of Populism in Government 140
 5. Concluding Remarks 143

PART IV. POPULIST CONSTITUTIONALISM FROM THE VIEWPOINT OF EMOTIONS AND CONSTITUTIONAL IMAGINATION

Populism, Constituent Power and Constitutional Imagination

- Paul BLOKKER 149
1. Introduction. 149
 2. Populist Constitutionalism 152
 3. Constituent Power. 155
 4. The Populist Imaginary 157
 5. Popular Sovereignty versus Global Legalism 162
 6. Legal Resentment or Populist Understandings of the Law 164
 7. Concluding Remarks 169

Law and Emotions: Insights for the Study of Anti-Constitutional Populism

Julia WESOŁOWSKA 171

1. Introduction. 171
2. The Affective in the Legal. 173
3. The Myth of Irrationality. 176
4. Are Constitutions Devoid of Emotions? 179
5. Too Much Emotion, or Not the Right Emotion? 181
6. Conclusion. 183

PART V. CHALLENGES TO CONSTITUTIONAL DEMOCRACY IN TIMES OF COVID-19 CONSTITUTIONALISM AND BEYOND

The Role of Fear Politics in Global Constitutional ‘Ernstfall’: Images of Fear under COVID-19 Health Paternalism

Martin BELOV 187

1. Introduction. 187
2. The Concept and Features of COVID-19
Constitutionalism 190
3. The Impact of COVID-19 on Constitutionalism,
Constitutional Principles and Human Rights 203
4. Fear and Fear Politics in Constitutional Law
and the Reformulation of Normalcy 206
5. Encoding Fear in Contemporary Constitutionalism
Through Fear Politics 211
6. The New Paternalistic State: The Health Leviathan 218

Democracy and Human Rights in Illiberal Constitutionalism

Tímea DRINÓCZI and Agnieszka BIEŃ-KACAŁA 221

1. Introduction. 222
2. Illiberal Values and Collective Narcissism. 223
3. Illiberal Democracy 228
4. Relativisation of Human Rights 236
5. COVID-19 242
6. Conclusion. 249

PART VI. THE SPREAD OF POPULISM AND ILLIBERAL DEMOCRACY IN EUROPE

Law, Revolution and Populism in Italy: The Path from Constitutional Resentment to Constitutional Renaissance

Monica BONINI 253

1. In Search of the Roots of Italian Populism 253
2. After World War II: The Sowing of a Dangerous Seed. 257
3. People and Democracy in the Italian Constitution 263
4. Italian Populism: A Threat to Constitutional Democracy? 268
5. Back to Piero Calamandrei: The Time has Come
for the 'Promised Revolution' 271

Polish Constitutionalism under Populist Rule: A Revolution without a Revolution

Przemysław TACIK 275

1. Introduction. 275
2. What is a Revolution without a Revolution? 279
3. A Revolutionary Project before the Revolution: The 2010
Constitutional Draft 287
4. Effective Suspension of the Constitution. 291
5. A Revolution without a Revolution: Populist Disconnection. 296
6. Conclusions 299

Representative Democracy in the Times of Populism: The Case of the Polish Parliament as a Delegated Power

Agnieszka BIEŃ-KACAŁA, Anna TARNOWSKA
and Wojciech WŁOCH 301

1. Introduction. 301
2. Constructing the 'Chain of Delegation' 302
3. From Representation to Discussion 307
4. From Discussion to Populism 310
5. Dysfunction of the 'Chain of Delegation' 314
6. Conclusion 318

**The Roots and Guises of Legal Populism in Russia: The *Narodniki*,
Statism and Legalism of Soviet Law and the Political
Theology of Ivan Ilyin**

Wojciech ENGELKING	319
1. Introduction.....	319
2. Russian Populism, the Guise of Ideology and the Anti-Gay Law	322
3. The Material Aspect: The Cult of the <i>Muzhik</i>	326
4. The Formal Aspect: Statism and Legalism of Soviet Law	330
5. The Material and Formal Aspect: The Political Theology of Ivan Ilyin	333
6. Conclusion.....	337
<i>Bibliography</i>	339
<i>Index</i>	377