

Theres Matthieß

Retrospective Pledge Voting and Political Accountability

The Costs of Broken Promises

palgrave
macmillan

Theres Matthieß
University of Göttingen
Göttingen, Niedersachsen, Germany

ISBN 978-3-031-54293-0 ISBN 978-3-031-54291-6 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-54291-6>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive license to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2024

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover illustration: © Alex Linch shutterstock.com

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

If disposing of this product, please recycle the paper.

CONTENTS

Part I	A Theoretical Framework for Understanding RPV	1
1	Election Pledges, Democratic Representation, and Voting	3
1.1	<i>The Democratic Need of a "Responsible Electorate"</i>	5
1.1.1	<i>Substantive Representation by Parties and the Chain of Democratic Linkage</i>	5
1.1.2	<i>Mandate of Pledge-Making and Fulfilment</i>	9
1.1.3	<i>Accountability Linkage: Holding Parties Accountable for Pledge Breakage</i>	15
1.2	<i>Bridging a Gap: Pledges, Government Performance and Voting</i>	17
1.2.1	<i>Previous Research on Party Competition and Government Performance</i>	17
1.2.2	<i>Previous Research on Perception of Pledge Performance</i>	20
1.2.3	<i>Previous Research on Prospective and Retrospective Voting</i>	21
1.2.4	<i>Contribution of This Book</i>	24
1.3	<i>The Book in a Nutshell</i>	27
2	How Pledge Performance Affects Voting	31
2.1	<i>From Pledge-Making to Retrospective Pledge Voting</i>	32
2.1.1	<i>Pledge-Making: Projected Policy Benefits</i>	32

2.1.2	<i>Authorising Election: A Leap of Faith</i>	34
2.1.3	<i>Governing Period: Pledge Performance</i>	36
2.1.4	<i>Sanctioning Election</i>	38
2.2	<i>The Political Context and Individual Constraints</i>	44
Part II	An Empirical Analysis of RPV	55
3	A Threefold Empirical Investigation of RPV	57
3.1	<i>Conceptualisation of Pledge Performance</i>	58
3.2	<i>Going from the Aggregate to the Micro Level</i>	60
3.2.1	<i>Investigating RPV at the Aggregate Level Based on Observational Data</i>	62
3.2.2	<i>Investigating RPV at the Group Level Based on Survey Data</i>	65
3.2.3	<i>Investigating RPV at the Micro Level Based on Experimental Data</i>	67
3.3	<i>Strength of the Design</i>	68
4	RPV at the Aggregate Level: Evidence from Observational Data	71
4.1	<i>Starting the Investigation at the Aggregate Level</i>	71
4.2	<i>How Pledge Performance Affects Electoral Outcomes at the Aggregate Level</i>	73
4.2.1	<i>RPV at the Aggregate Level</i>	73
4.2.2	<i>Constraints of RPV at the Aggregate Level: The Role of the Political Context</i>	74
4.3	<i>Research Design</i>	75
4.3.1	<i>Measuring Electoral Outcome</i>	78
4.3.2	<i>Measuring the Independent Variable</i>	79
4.3.3	<i>Measuring the Moderating Variables</i>	80
4.3.4	<i>Measuring Control Variables</i>	82
4.4	<i>Empirical Analysis</i>	84
4.5	<i>Summary and Preliminary Conclusion</i>	90

5	RPV at the Group Level: Evidence from Survey Data	93
5.1	<i>Bringing Together Social Groups, Egocentric Voting and Pledges</i>	93
5.2	<i>Group-Specific, Egocentric RPV</i>	96
5.2.1	<i>Constraints of Group-Specific, Egocentric RPV</i>	100
5.3	<i>Research Design</i>	102
5.3.1	<i>Case Selection: Countries, Elections, and Groups</i>	102
5.3.2	<i>Measuring the Dependent Variable: Voting of Group Members</i>	104
5.3.3	<i>Measuring the Independent Variable: Group-Specific Pledge Performance</i>	106
5.3.4	<i>Measuring the Moderating Variables</i>	107
5.3.5	<i>Measuring the Control Variables</i>	108
5.4	<i>Empirical Analysis</i>	109
5.4.1	<i>The Making and Breaking of Group-Specific Pledges</i>	109
5.4.2	<i>Analysis: Group-Specific, Egocentric RPV</i>	111
5.5	<i>Summary and Preliminary Conclusion</i>	121
6	RPV at the Micro Level: Evidence from Experimental Data	125
6.1	<i>Going Down to the Micro Level</i>	125
6.2	<i>How Information About Pledge Non-fulfilment Decreases the PTV</i>	129
6.2.1	<i>RPV at the Micro Level</i>	129
6.2.2	<i>Constraints of RPV at the Micro Level</i>	132
6.3	<i>Experiment I (Real-World)</i>	133
6.3.1	<i>Research Design</i>	133
6.3.2	<i>Empirical Analysis</i>	138
6.4	<i>Experiment II (Hypothetical)</i>	144
6.4.1	<i>Research Design</i>	144
6.4.2	<i>Empirical Analysis</i>	147
6.5	<i>Summary and Preliminary Conclusion</i>	150

Part III The Impact of RPV & a Path for Informed Governance	155
7 New Evidence on RPV	157
7.1 <i>Retrospective Pledge Voting Unconstrained?</i>	157
7.2 <i>Adding a Missing Puzzle Piece</i>	165
8 A Good or Bad Sign for Democracy?	171
8.1 <i>The Existence of a Responsible Electorate and an Accountability Linkage</i>	171
8.2 <i>The Duty to Be Responsible and Transparent</i>	176
A Appendix Chap. 4: RPV at the Aggregate Level	181
B Appendix Chap. 5: RPV at the Group Level	191
C Appendix Chap. 6: RPV at the Micro Level	217
Reference	225
Index	243