

Ms. J. Gerhardt

IMPEACHMENT

WHAT EVERYONE NEEDS TO KNOW®

MICHAEL J. GERHARDT

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and certain other countries.

"What Everyone Needs to Know" is a registered trademark of Oxford University Press.

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America.

© Oxford University Press 2018

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by license, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reproduction rights organization. Inquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above.

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Gerhardt, Michael J., 1956–, author.

Title: Impeachment : what everyone needs to know / Michael J. Gerhardt.

Description: New York : Oxford University Press, 2018. |

Series: What Everyone Needs to Know |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018013560 (print) | LCCN 2018013641 (ebook) |

ISBN 9780190903671 (updf) | ISBN 9780190903688 (epub) |

ISBN 9780190903657 (pbk. : alk. paper) |

ISBN 9780190903664 (hardback : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Impeachments—United States | Presidents—United States.

Classification: LCC KF5075 (ebook) | LCC KF5075 .G47 2018 (print) |

DDC 342.73/068—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018013560>

1 3 5 7 9 8 6 4 2

Paperback printed by LSC Communications, United States of America
Hardback printed by Bridgeport National Bindery, Inc., United States of America

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	XV
Introduction	1
1. The Basic Terms	6
<i>What does the term "impeachment" mean?</i>	6
<i>What does the Constitution explicitly say about the impeachment process?</i>	7
<i>What does the Constitution implicitly say about impeachment?</i>	8
<i>What are the emoluments clauses?</i>	10
<i>What are the origins of impeachment?</i>	11
<i>What were the specific controversies regarding official misconduct that the Constitutional Convention addressed?</i>	12
<i>What were the plans that the framers debated before settling on the version of the impeachment process set forth in the Constitution?</i>	13
<i>What happened next?</i>	14
<i>What do the basic terms in the impeachment clauses mean?</i>	18
<i>Is impeachment a legal or political issue?</i>	20
<i>How useful is impeachment?</i>	22
<i>Is impeachment the only mechanism for addressing the serious misconduct of the president, the vice president, and other officials subject to impeachment?</i>	22

2. The History of the Federal Impeachment Process 24

<i>How many people have been impeached, and why?</i>	24
<i>How many of the nineteen people whom the House impeached did the Senate convict and remove from office?</i>	25
<i>How many times has the Senate imposed the sanction of disqualification?</i>	26
<i>What exactly is disqualification?</i>	26
<i>How many officials has the Senate acquitted or found not guilty and therefore not convicted and removed from office?</i>	26
<i>How many officials were impeached but avoided conviction and removal because they resigned from office before their impeachment trials commenced?</i>	26
<i>Were there any other officials who were impeached but somehow avoided having the Senate hold an impeachment trial or convict them for impeachable misconduct?</i>	28
<i>Was Andrew Johnson the first president to be threatened with impeachment?</i>	29
<i>How many presidents have been impeached?</i>	31
<i>Why was Andrew Johnson impeached?</i>	31
<i>Why didn't the Senate convict Andrew Johnson and remove him from office?</i>	32
<i>Would Richard Nixon have been impeached had he not resigned?</i>	34
<i>Why was Bill Clinton impeached?</i>	34
<i>Why did the Senate not convict President Clinton?</i>	36
<i>Why wasn't George W. Bush impeached?</i>	38
<i>Why wasn't Barack Obama impeached?</i>	39

3. Which Federal Officials Are Impeachable 41

<i>Who is subject to impeachment?</i>	41
<i>Are members of Congress subject to impeachment?</i>	42
<i>For purposes of impeachment, to whom does the phrase "all civil officers of the United States" refer?</i>	43
<i>If there is not universal consensus on the meaning of "all civil officers of the United States," who disagrees with that interpretation of the Constitution and why?</i>	45
<i>So, who is right about the meaning of "all civil officers of the United States"?</i>	47

<i>Are Article III judges subject to impeachment?</i>	52
<i>To what extent are officials subject to impeachment for misconduct before their election or appointment to impeachable offices?</i>	55
<i>To what extent are officials subject to impeachment for misconduct after they have left office?</i>	57

4. Defining Impeachable Offenses **59**

<i>What do the study of the origins of the Constitution and our experiences with impeachment teach us about the meaning of the terms “other high crimes or misdemeanors”?</i>	59
<i>In impeachment proceedings, how have the members of Congress understood the meaning of “other high crimes and misdemeanors”?</i>	62
<i>Is the Congress bound by its prior practices or could it deviate from, or even abandon, those practices in the future?</i>	64
<i>Must an impeachable offense have a connection to an official’s office or duties?</i>	65
<i>May someone be impeached for gross incompetence?</i>	67
<i>So, how are we supposed to determine what qualifies as “serious offenses” against the Republic or breaches of the public trust?</i>	69
<i>What is an example of an abuse of power that is impeachable?</i>	70
<i>Who is Joe Isenberg, and why do his writings come up in some discussions of the scope of impeachable offenses?</i>	70

5. Explaining the Procedures in Impeachment **73**

<i>How does an impeachment begin?</i>	73
<i>What is the House’s role?</i>	74
<i>Does the House have a constitutional obligation to do any fact-finding?</i>	76
<i>What is the Senate’s role in the impeachment process?</i>	78
<i>What does it mean for the Senate to have the power “to try an impeachment?” Must it hold an actual trial for the impeached official?</i>	79
<i>Is it possible to appeal an impeachment conviction to the Supreme Court?</i>	83
<i>What role does the chief justice of the United States have in the impeachment process?</i>	85
<i>What if the chief justice himself is the subject of an impeachment process?</i>	86

<i>Who presides over a vice president's impeachment trial, given that the Constitution makes the vice president the presiding officer of the Senate?</i>	87
<i>What difference, if any, does the Fifth Amendment make to impeachment proceedings?</i>	87
<i>Is there a burden of proof required in impeachment proceedings?</i>	90
<i>Are any rules of evidence required in impeachment proceedings?</i>	91
<i>Does double jeopardy apply to an impeachment?</i>	91
<i>May an impeachment come before civil or criminal proceedings?</i>	92
<i>Have any courts addressed the question of whether impeachment may precede or must follow a criminal indictment?</i>	94
<i>What about high-ranking executive branch officials other than the president? Are they immune to criminal prosecution while they are in office?</i>	98
<i>Is it permissible for a sitting president to be subject to civil lawsuits for damages, or to be criminally indicted and prosecuted? Or must a president be impeached and removed from office beforehand?</i>	100
<i>Does a prior conviction or judgment from a court carry any weight in an impeachment proceeding?</i>	102
<i>Do any special privileges apply in impeachment proceedings?</i>	103
<i>Are there any other privileges that might apply in impeachment proceedings?</i>	105
<i>Does the pardon power extend to impeachment proceedings?</i>	106

6. Explaining What Punishments the Senate May Impose 107

<i>What punishments may be imposed in an impeachment proceeding?</i>	107
<i>What happens when the Senate acquits someone?</i>	107
<i>What happens when someone is convicted?</i>	108
<i>What is disqualification?</i>	109
<i>Does the Constitution require that the sanctions of removal and disqualification be imposed at the same time, or may (or must) they be imposed separately?</i>	109
<i>How many times has the Senate disqualified an official it convicted?</i>	110
<i>Why is disqualification rarely imposed?</i>	111
<i>Does disqualification require at least two-thirds approval in the Senate, as removal does, or may it be done by a majority vote?</i>	111

<i>Who is Alcee Hastings and why is he relevant?</i>	112
<i>What is censure?</i>	113
<i>Is presidential censure constitutional?</i>	114
<i>What is a bill of attainder?</i>	116
<i>Is censure a bill of attainder?</i>	116
<i>Is it permissible for the Senate to issue or approve findings of fact?</i>	116
<i>Are there any other sanctions falling short of removal and disqualification that Congress may impose on public officials for their misconduct in office?</i>	118
<i>What about the Bribery Act of 1790? Is that relevant, and was it constitutional?</i>	119
<i>Are there any other alternatives to impeachment worth knowing about?</i>	124
7. Impeachment in the States and around the World	125
<i>What were the models for the federal impeachment process?</i>	125
<i>How common is impeachment in the states?</i>	125
<i>What are some examples of the different grounds that states provide as the bases for impeachment?</i>	128
<i>Do states use other or additional means than impeachment for addressing the misconduct of public officials?</i>	129
<i>Have there been any impeachments in states that are of particular significance?</i>	130
<i>Have there been any notable impeachment attempts in the states that failed?</i>	132
<i>What are some notable instances of states' using mechanisms other than impeachment to address officials' misconduct?</i>	135
<i>How popular is the impeachment process around the world?</i>	140
<i>What world leaders outside of the United States have been impeached in recent history?</i>	141
<i>Have there been notable failed impeachment attempts outside of the United States in recent history?</i>	143
8. Will Donald Trump Be Impeached?	145
<i>Will Donald Trump be impeached?</i>	145
<i>What are the most serious charges made against the president?</i>	146

<i>How many lawsuits were filed against Donald Trump prior to his election as president?</i>	148
<i>What is the relevance of any of the lawsuits pending against the president at the time of his inauguration or filed against him since then?</i>	149
<i>Which constitutional clauses pertaining to emoluments might have relevance to the question whether President Trump has possibly committed any impeachable offense?</i>	150
<i>Would violating either the foreign emoluments or the compensation clause be an impeachable offense?</i>	151
<i>What if the payment, gift, or benefit given to the president came from a source other than a foreign power?</i>	153
<i>Is it a problem that the president has never disclosed his tax returns or the sources of his income and the degree of his indebtedness?</i>	155
<i>How do we know where to draw the line on what is impeachable or what is not when it comes to a president's receipt of foreign or other financial gifts?</i>	157
<i>What about Hillary Clinton's emails? Didn't she break the law, and should she face criminal liability and perhaps impeachment because of her misconduct?</i>	157
<i>President Trump's lawyer has said that the president is immune in the civil cases that have been filed against him. Is the president's lawyer right?</i>	159
<i>What is collusion?</i>	160
<i>Why do people keep talking about "collusion" if the term has no meaning in the law?</i>	160
<i>Who is Robert Mueller, and what is his role in investigating President Trump?</i>	160
<i>If Mueller is not looking at collusion, what exactly is he investigating?</i>	161
<i>Who is James Comey, and why is he relevant to Mueller's investigation?</i>	161
<i>Are any of the things Mueller is investigating impeachable offenses?</i>	163
<i>Does the president have the power to fire the special counsel, Robert Mueller?</i>	164
<i>Richard Nixon fired the special prosecutor who was investigating Watergate, Archibald Cox. Why wasn't he impeached for that?</i>	165
<i>Is firing the special counsel an impeachable offense?</i>	166
<i>President Trump's lawyer has said the president cannot obstruct justice. Is he right?</i>	168
<i>Why is sexual harassment an impeachable offense?</i>	171

<i>Could President Trump be impeached for doing any of the things he claimed in an Access Hollywood interview that was aired during the presidential campaign?</i>	172
<i>How is the case of Alex Kozinski relevant to our understanding of whether sexual harassment may constitute an impeachable offense?</i>	174
<i>Would Kozinski's misconduct have been a legitimate basis for impeachment?</i>	175
<i>How might the Kozinski case help us better understand impeachment?</i>	176
<i>May the president use his pardon power to stop the Congress from attempting to impeach him or anyone else close to him?</i>	176
<i>Was President Trump's pardon of Sheriff Joe an abuse of power?</i>	177
<i>May the president pardon himself and, if he does, is that an abuse of power and therefore an impeachable offense?</i>	178
<i>What if members of Congress and the public cannot agree on the severity of the misconduct or the damage that the misconduct caused?</i>	180
<i>What are norms, and why are they relevant to this discussion?</i>	181
<i>If President Trump is incompetent, may he be impeached for that?</i>	182
<i>How does the Twenty-fifth Amendment work?</i>	184
<i>Could President Trump have a problem with the Twenty-fifth Amendment?</i>	185
<i>Would it be wrong to take into account the fact that Mike Pence would become president if President Trump were either removed or resigned from office?</i>	188
<i>Are the president's tweets in any way impeachable offenses?</i>	188
<i>What about —?</i>	192

Conclusion **196**

APPENDIX: TABLE OF US IMPEACHMENTS **201**

NOTES **205**

BIBLIOGRAPHY **243**

INDEX **245**