

Redistribution or Recognition?

A Political–Philosophical Exchange



NANCY FRASER

and

AXEL HONNETH

Translated by Joel Golb, James Ingram,
and Christiane Wilke



VERSO

London • New York

First published by Verso 2003
© Nancy Fraser and Axel Honneth 2003
Translation © Joel Golb, James Ingram, and Christiane Wilke 2003

All rights reserved

The moral rights of the authors and translators have been asserted

5 7 9 10 8 6 4

Verso

UK: 6 Meard Street, London W1F 0EG
USA: 20 Jay Street, Suite 1010, Brooklyn, NY 11201
www.versobooks.com

Verso is the imprint of New Left Books

ISBN 1-85984-648-3
ISBN 1-85984-492-8 (pbk)

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Fraser, Nancy

Redistribution or recognition? : a political-philosophical exchange

1. Political science – Philosophy 2. Social justice

I. Title II. Honneth, Axel, 1949–

320'.011

ISBN-13: 978-1-85984-492-2

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Fraser, Nancy.

[Umverteilung oder Anerkennung? English]

Redistribution or recognition? : a political-philosophical exchange/Nancy Fraser and
Axel Honneth ; translated by Joel Golb, James Ingram, and Christiane Wilke.

p. cm.

Includes index.

1. Social justice. 2. Capitalism--Moral and ethical aspects. 3. Identity (Philosophical
concept) 4. Recognition (Philosophy) I. Honneth, Axel, 1949-- II. Title.

HM671.F713 2003

303.3'72--dc22

2003057675

Typeset in Bembo by SetSystems Ltd, Saffron Walden, Essex

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Introduction: Redistribution or Recognition? <i>Nancy Fraser and Axel Honneth</i>	1
1 Social Justice in the Age of Identity Politics: Redistribution, Recognition, and Participation <i>Nancy Fraser</i>	7
I. Redistribution or Recognition? A Critique of Justice Truncated	9
II. Integrating Redistribution and Recognition: Problems in Moral Philosophy	26
III. Social-Theoretical Issues: On Class and Status in Capitalist Society	48
IV. Political-Theoretical Issues: Institutionalizing Democratic Justice	70
V. Concluding Conjunctural Reflections: Post- Fordism, Postcommunism, and Globalization	88

2	Redistribution as Recognition: A Response to Nancy Fraser	110
	<i>Axel Honneth</i>	
I.	On the Phenomenology of Experiences of Social Injustice	114
II.	The Capitalist Recognition Order and Conflicts over Distribution	135
III.	Recognition and Social Justice	160
3	Distorted Beyond All Recognition: A Rejoinder to Axel Honneth	198
	<i>Nancy Fraser</i>	
I.	On the Place of Experience in Critical Theory: Against the Reduction of Political Sociology to Moral Psychology	201
II.	On the Cultural Turn in Social Theory: Against the Reduction of Capitalist Society to its Recognition Order	211
III.	On Liberal Equality: Against the Reduction of Justice to an Ethics of Intact Identity	222
4	The Point of Recognition: A Rejoinder to the Rejoinder	237
	<i>Axel Honneth</i>	
I.	Critical Social Theory and Immanent Transcendence	238
II.	Capitalism and Culture: Social Integration, System Integration, and Perspectival Dualism	248
III.	History and Normativity: On the Limits of Deontology	256
	Index	269