

Constitutional Erosion in Brazil

Emilio Peluso Neder Meyer

• H A R T •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

HART PUBLISHING

Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

Kemp House, Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford, OX2 9PH, UK

1385 Broadway, New York, NY 10018, USA

29 Earlsfort Terrace, Dublin 2, Ireland

HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the Diana logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

First published in Great Britain 2021

First published in hardback, 2021

Paperback edition, 2023

Copyright © Emilio Peluso Neder Meyer, 2021

Emilio Peluso Neder Meyer has asserted his right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as Author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or damage occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it can be accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown Copyright ©.

All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is Parliamentary Copyright ©.

This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 (<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>) except where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union, <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2023.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Meyer, Emilio Peluso Neder, author.

Title: Constitutional erosion in Brazil / Emilio Peluso Neder Meyer.

Description: Oxford ; New York : Hart, 2021. | Series: Constitutionalism in Latin America and the Caribbean ; volume 1 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021017088 (print) | LCCN 2021017089 (ebook) | ISBN 9781509941957 (hardback) | ISBN 9781509950508 (paperback) | ISBN 9781509942602 (pdf) | ISBN 9781509941964 (Epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Constitutional history—Brazil. | Brazil—Politics and government—1985–2002. | Brazil—Politics and government—2003–

Classification: LCC KHD2919 .M49 2021 (print) | LCC KHD2919 (ebook) | DDC 342.8102/9—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021017088>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021017089>

ISBN: PB: 978-1-50995-050-8

ePDF: 978-1-50994-260-2

ePub: 978-1-50994-196-4

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon

To find out more about our authors and books visit www.hartpublishing.co.uk.

Here you will find extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

Table of Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>vii</i>
Introduction: Defining Brazil's Constitutional Erosion	1
I. What is a Constitutional Crisis?	3
II. Constitutional Erosion	7
III. Constitutional Crisis and Constitutional Erosion: A Comparative Assessment.....	10
IV. Brazil under Bolsonaro: Soldiers as Politicians.....	13
V. Armed Forces and Politics: Brazil and Beyond.....	17
VI. The Structure of this Book.....	19
1. Transitional Constitutionalism: Judicial and Military	
Attempts at Controlling a Transition	24
I. The Brazilian Dictatorship of 1964–1985 Juridical Apparatus.....	28
II. Transitional Justice Processes Shaping Constitutionalism	34
III. Amnesty and the Federal Supreme Court.....	40
IV. The 1964–1985 Dictatorship on Trial	45
V. Interactions between Brazilian Institutions and the Inter-American Court of Human Rights	48
VI. The Military in Brazil: From Impunity to Politics	50
2. Social-Democratic Constitutionalism: Neoliberal	
Unconstitutional Politics and Socio-Economic Rights	52
I. Authoritarianism and Neoliberalism	55
II. Constitutions and Economic Power.....	58
III. Transformative Constitutionalism and Transformative Justice.....	60
IV. Socio-economic Rights, Constitutionalism and Transition in South Africa	66
V. Socio-economic Rights, Constitutionalism and Transition in Brazil	71
VI. Neoliberalism and Transitional Constitutionalism	75
3. Institutional and Personal Judicial Guarantees: Judges, Inequality and Politics	79
I. Against the Transition: The Lack of Efficient Judicial Institutional Reforms	82
II. Corporatist Guarantees.....	84

III.	Operation Car Wash: Taming Politics through Judicial Discourse.....	89
IV.	The Personification of Operation Car Wash.....	90
V.	From the Bench to Politics.....	93
VI.	Individualities v Institutional Behaviour.....	100
4.	Judges and Courts Destabilising Constitutionalism	103
I.	Deputies and Senators in the Federal Supreme Court.....	105
II.	The Judicial Oversight of an Impeachment	110
III.	Ruling on Presumption of Innocence: Balancing and Unbalancing Constitutional Rights.....	113
IV.	Imprisoning the Ex-President.....	116
V.	Constitutional Courts and Political Instability.....	118
VI.	Unstable Constitutionalism in Brazil.....	125
5.	Subverting the Rule of Law: The Military vs the Milicias – Eroding Brazilian Constitutionalism	129
I.	The Military in Brazilian Post-1988 Democracy.....	132
II.	Soldiers Returning to Politics	135
III.	Militarised Public Security	139
IV.	Supporting Elections via <i>Milicias</i>	141
V.	Constitutional Erosion or Blatant Coups? A Comparative Assessment.....	148
VI.	Fuelling Attacks on Constitutional Democracy	151
6.	Moderating Powers? Military and Judges in Brazilian Constitutionalism	154
I.	An Overview of the Moderating Power	156
II.	Authoritarianism: A Substitute for the Moderating Power	159
III.	The Ghost of the Moderating Power and the Military Elite	164
IV.	1964–1985 – Suspension and Return of the Moderating Model	166
V.	Moderating Power Transfer: From the Military to the Judiciary and Back again.....	168
VI.	A Case of Weak Democracy Syndrome	172
7.	Digital Constitutionalism: WhatsApp Elections and Fake News	176
I.	Capitalism, New Technologies and Democracy	181
II.	Surveillance Capitalism and Instrumentarian Power	185
III.	Politics and Network Propaganda	189
IV.	Fake News, Authoritarianism and Political Choices.....	192

V. WhatsApp, Elections and Misinformation.....	195
VI. Controlling Fake News in Brazil.....	197
8. Constitutional Resilience against Erosion: Responses Provided for by the 1988 Constitution	199
I. Coalitional Presidentialism and its Misuse	203
II. The Constant Threat of Impeachment	204
III. Capturing State Institutions and Fighting the Media.....	210
IV. Parliamentary Control and the Abuse of Executive Orders.....	215
V. On Federalism: The Governors' Reactions.....	217
VI. 'I Will Interfere!' The Federal Supreme Court Fights Back.....	219
<i>Epilogue</i>	225
<i>Index</i>	231