

# Women and International Human Rights in Modern Times

A Contemporary Casebook

---

Rosa Celorio

*Burnett Family Associate Dean and Professorial Lecturer for International and Comparative Legal Studies, George Washington University Law School, USA*

 **Edward Elgar**  
PUBLISHING

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

© Rosa Celorio 2022

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by  
Edward Elgar Publishing Limited  
The Lypiatts  
15 Lansdown Road  
Cheltenham  
Glos GL50 2JA  
UK

Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc.  
William Pratt House  
9 Dewey Court  
Northampton  
Massachusetts 01060  
USA

A catalogue record for this book  
is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Control Number: 2021952861

This book is available electronically in the **Elgaronline**  
Law subject collection  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.4337/9781800889392>

Printed on elemental chlorine free (ECF)  
recycled paper containing 30% Post-Consumer Waste

ISBN 978 1 80088 938 5 (cased)  
ISBN 978 1 80088 939 2 (eBook)

Printed and bound in the USA

# Contents

---

|                                                                                                                                           |           |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| <i>Preface</i>                                                                                                                            | xiii      |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i>                                                                                                                   | xvii      |
| <br>                                                                                                                                      |           |
| <b>1 Discrimination against women: doctrine, practice, and the path forward</b>                                                           | <b>1</b>  |
| I Introduction: Discrimination against women through the lens of international human rights law                                           | 1         |
| II CEDAW and discrimination against women                                                                                                 | 3         |
| A Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW)                                                      | 4         |
| B Reflections and Questions                                                                                                               | 9         |
| III CEDAW Committee: discrimination against women and state obligations                                                                   | 13        |
| A The core obligations of State parties under Article 2 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women | 13        |
| B Reflections and Questions                                                                                                               | 15        |
| IV Universal human rights treaties: the covenants and beyond                                                                              | 18        |
| A International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights                                                                                    | 19        |
| B International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights                                                                          | 21        |
| C Reflections and Questions                                                                                                               | 23        |
| D <i>Sharon McIvor and Jacob Grismer</i>                                                                                                  | 24        |
| E Reflections and Questions                                                                                                               | 26        |
| V Discrimination on the basis of sex at the national level                                                                                | 27        |
| A <i>United States v. Virginia</i>                                                                                                        | 28        |
| B Reflections and Questions                                                                                                               | 30        |
| VI Stereotypes and cultural patterns of behavior                                                                                          | 32        |
| A <i>Karen Tayag Vertido v. Philippines</i> (Excerpts)                                                                                    | 33        |
| B Reflections and Questions                                                                                                               | 35        |
| VII Final comments: CEDAW in practice                                                                                                     | 37        |
| <br>                                                                                                                                      |           |
| <b>2 Gender-based violence as a form of discrimination</b>                                                                                | <b>38</b> |
| I Introduction: The widespread nature of gender-based violence                                                                            | 38        |
| II Gender-based violence as an international human rights issue                                                                           | 39        |

|          |                                                                                                                                                      |    |
|----------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| A        | CEDAW Committee, General Recommendation No. 19, Violence against Women                                                                               | 39 |
| B        | Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women                                                                                             | 41 |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                            | 43 |
| III      | Gender-based violence against women                                                                                                                  | 45 |
| A        | General Recommendation No. 35 on Gender-Based Violence against Women, Updating General Recommendation No. 19                                         | 45 |
| B        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                            | 47 |
| IV       | Regional approaches to gender-based violence                                                                                                         | 49 |
| A        | Inter-American Convention on the Punishment, Prevention, and Eradication of Violence against Women (hereinafter “Convention of Belém do Pará”), 1994 | 49 |
| B        | African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa (hereinafter “Maputo Protocol”), 2003                                  | 51 |
| C        | Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence (hereinafter “Istanbul Convention”), 2011      | 54 |
| D        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                            | 57 |
| E        | Practical exercise: Comparison of regional treaties on violence against women                                                                        | 59 |
| V        | Problem of femicide and extreme forms of gender-based violence                                                                                       | 61 |
| A        | Report of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences, Rashida Manjoo                                              | 61 |
| B        | <i>González et al. v. Mexico</i> (“Cotton Field” case), Inter-American Court of Human Rights                                                         | 63 |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                            | 66 |
| VI       | Final comments: Gender-based violence, the “MeToo movement,” and social protest                                                                      | 67 |
| <b>3</b> | <b>Intersectionality and the interconnectedness of discrimination: the case of indigenous women</b>                                                  | 69 |
| I        | Introduction: Intersectional forms of discrimination and the experience of indigenous women                                                          | 69 |
| II       | Discrimination with a gender, indigenous women, intersectional, and intercultural perspective                                                        | 71 |
| A        | Article 9, Inter-American Convention on the Punishment, Prevention, and Eradication of Violence against Women (“Convention of Belém do Pará”), 1994  | 71 |
| B        | Article 1, Inter-American Convention against all Forms of Discrimination and Intolerance                                                             | 71 |
| C        | Report of the Special Rapporteur on indigenous peoples, Victoria Tauli Corpuz                                                                        | 72 |

|          |                                                                                  |     |
|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| D        | Reflections and Questions                                                        | 74  |
| III      | Intersectional discrimination against indigenous women: individual case examples | 78  |
| A        | CEDAW Committee, <i>Cecilia Kell v. Canada</i>                                   | 78  |
| B        | <i>Valentina Rosendo Cantú</i> , Inter-American Court of Human Rights            | 80  |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                        | 83  |
| IV       | Resolving the puzzle of intersectional equality                                  | 86  |
| <b>4</b> | <b>Sexual orientation and gender identity</b>                                    | 87  |
| I        | Introduction: The evolution of gender equality                                   | 87  |
| II       | Sexual orientation and gender identity as prohibited factors of discrimination   | 89  |
| A        | <i>Karen Atala v. Chile</i> , Inter-American Court of Human Rights               | 89  |
| B        | <i>Bostock v. Clayton County</i> , United States Supreme Court                   | 92  |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                        | 95  |
| III      | The right to privacy                                                             | 97  |
| A        | <i>Toonen v. Australia</i> , United Nations Human Rights Committee               | 98  |
| B        | <i>Martha Lucia Álvarez Giraldo</i> , Inter-American Commission on Human Rights  | 99  |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                        | 101 |
| IV       | The right to gender identity and expression                                      | 103 |
| A        | <i>Christine Goodwin v. United Kingdom</i> , European Court of Human Rights      | 104 |
| B        | Reflections and Questions                                                        | 105 |
| V        | Marriage equality                                                                | 107 |
| A        | <i>Obergefell v. Hodges</i> , United States Supreme Court                        | 107 |
| B        | Reflections and Questions                                                        | 111 |
| VI       | Conclusions: What lies ahead for LGBTI issues and women's rights                 | 112 |
| <b>5</b> | <b>Women and times of emergency: the case of COVID-19</b>                        | 114 |
| I        | Introduction: Times of emergency and their burdens on women                      | 114 |
| II       | Discrimination and gender-based violence during COVID-19                         | 116 |
| A        | United Nations Secretary General, Policy Brief: The Impact of COVID-19 on Women  | 117 |
| B        | Violence against women as the "shadow pandemic"                                  | 118 |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                        | 119 |
| III      | State obligations during public emergencies: universal treaties                  | 120 |
| A        | Article 4: States of Emergency, Human Rights Committee                           | 120 |
| B        | Guidance Note on CEDAW and COVID-19, CEDAW Committee                             | 122 |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                        | 123 |
| IV       | Regional human rights protection systems and COVID-19                            | 124 |

|          |                                                                                                                                                                                                   |            |
|----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| A        | Respecting democracy, rule of law, and human rights in the framework of the COVID-19 sanitary crisis: A toolkit for member states                                                                 | 125        |
| B        | Pandemic and human rights in the Americas                                                                                                                                                         | 126        |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                         | 127        |
| D        | Practical exercise: Analysis of COVID-19 restrictions with a human rights perspective                                                                                                             | 129        |
| V        | Women as leaders in times of crisis                                                                                                                                                               | 129        |
| A        | COVID-19 and women's leadership: from an effective response to building back better                                                                                                               | 130        |
| B        | Inter-American Model Law on the Prevention, Punishment and Eradication of Violence against Women in Political Life                                                                                | 131        |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                         | 132        |
| VI       | Conclusions: The long-term effects of COVID-19 on the human rights of women                                                                                                                       | 135        |
| <b>6</b> | <b>Due diligence in the contemporary world: the era of MeToo, non-state actors, and social protest</b>                                                                                            | <b>136</b> |
| I        | Introduction: The intricate nature of due diligence and state responsibility in the era of <i>MeToo</i>                                                                                           | 136        |
| II       | Due diligence: prevention, investigation, sanction, and reparations                                                                                                                               | 137        |
| A        | Report of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes, and consequences, Yakin Erturk, <i>The due diligence standard as a tool for the elimination of violence against women</i> | 137        |
| B        | <i>Opuz v. Turkey</i> , European Court of Human Rights                                                                                                                                            | 139        |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                         | 142        |
| III      | The <i>MeToo</i> movement: turning the invisible visible                                                                                                                                          | 143        |
| A        | Confronting Sexual Violence, Demanding Equality                                                                                                                                                   | 143        |
| B        | Allison Page and Jacqueline Arcy, # <i>MeToo</i> and the Politics of Collective Healing: Emotional Connection as Contestation                                                                     | 145        |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                         | 147        |
| IV       | Non-state actors and due diligence                                                                                                                                                                | 150        |
| A        | Excerpts from <i>Jessica Lenahan (Gonzalez et al. v. United States)</i>                                                                                                                           | 150        |
| B        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                         | 152        |
| V        | Social protest to enforce due diligence                                                                                                                                                           | 155        |
| A        | Paula Serafini, "A Rapist in Your Path", <i>Transnational Feminist Protest and Why (and How) Performance Matters</i>                                                                              | 155        |
| B        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                         | 157        |
| VI       | Conclusions: The long road to guarantee effective due diligence in cases of gender-based violence                                                                                                 | 158        |

|          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |            |
|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>7</b> | <b>The challenging road to equality and the pursuit of non-discrimination</b>                                                                                                                                   | <b>160</b> |
| I        | Introduction: Discrimination on the basis of sex and legal tendencies                                                                                                                                           | 160        |
| II       | Vulnerability and stereotypes                                                                                                                                                                                   | 161        |
| A        | Lourdes Peroni and Alexandra Timmer, <i>Vulnerable Groups: The Promise of an Emerging Concept in European Human Rights Convention Law</i>                                                                       | 161        |
| B        | <i>Carvalho Pinto de Sousa Mourais v. Portugal</i> , European Court of Human Rights                                                                                                                             | 164        |
| C        | <i>Gonzalez Lluy et. al v. Ecuador</i> , Inter-American Court of Human Rights                                                                                                                                   | 165        |
| D        | European Court of Human Rights, <i>BS v. Spain</i>                                                                                                                                                              | 167        |
| E        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                                       | 169        |
| III      | Strict scrutiny                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 172        |
| A        | <i>Maria Eugenia Morales de Sierra v. Guatemala</i> , Inter-American Commission on Human Rights                                                                                                                 | 172        |
| B        | <i>Konstantin Markin v. Russia</i> , European Court of Human Rights                                                                                                                                             | 173        |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                                       | 176        |
| IV       | Hate speech and gender ideology                                                                                                                                                                                 | 177        |
| A        | Council of Europe, Commissioner for Human Rights, <i>Hate Speech Against Women Should be Specifically Tackled</i> (2014)                                                                                        | 177        |
| B        | Tanya Kateri Hernández, <i>Hate Speech and the Language of Racism in Latin America: A Lens for Reconsidering Global Hate Speech Restrictions and Legislation Models</i>                                         | 178        |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                                       | 179        |
| V        | Conclusions: Towards the autonomy and leadership of women from a human rights perspective                                                                                                                       | 182        |
| <b>8</b> | <b>Sexual and reproductive rights: a gender equality and international law approach</b>                                                                                                                         | <b>184</b> |
| I        | Introduction: Sexual and reproductive rights as women's rights                                                                                                                                                  | 184        |
| II       | Accessibility, affordability, and quality of sexual and reproductive health services                                                                                                                            | 185        |
| A        | Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development                                                                                                                               | 185        |
| B        | Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, General Comment 22, <i>On the Right to sexual and reproductive health (article 12 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights)</i> | 188        |
| C        | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                                       | 190        |
| III      | The regulation of abortion                                                                                                                                                                                      | 195        |
| A        | <i>Roe v. Wade</i> , 410 U.S. 113 (1973)                                                                                                                                                                        | 197        |
| B        | <i>VO v. France</i>                                                                                                                                                                                             | 201        |

|           |                                                                                                                                                 |     |
|-----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
|           | C Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                     | 202 |
| IV        | Maternal health, mortality, and morbidity                                                                                                       | 205 |
|           | A <i>Alyne Da Silva Pimentel Teixeira v. Brazil</i> , CEDAW Committee                                                                           | 205 |
|           | B Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                     | 208 |
| V         | The right to life and assisted reproductive technologies                                                                                        | 209 |
|           | A <i>Artavia Murillo v. Costa Rica</i> , Inter-American Court of Human Rights                                                                   | 210 |
|           | B Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                     | 214 |
| VI        | Conclusions: Distance between the theory and the practical application of sexual and reproductive rights today                                  | 215 |
| <b>9</b>  | <b>Economic, social, and cultural rights of women</b>                                                                                           | 217 |
| I         | Introduction: The economic autonomy and dignified life of women                                                                                 | 217 |
| II        | The puzzle of progressive and immediate obligations: economic, social, and cultural rights                                                      | 219 |
|           | A African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights (Banjul Charter)                                                                                 | 219 |
|           | B American Convention on Human Rights                                                                                                           | 220 |
|           | C Additional Protocol to the American Convention on Human Rights in the Area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Protocol of San Salvador) | 220 |
|           | D European Social Charter                                                                                                                       | 222 |
|           | E Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                     | 223 |
|           | F Human Rights Committee, General Comment 16                                                                                                    | 227 |
|           | G Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                     | 229 |
| III       | Decent and quality employment: the situation of women                                                                                           | 231 |
|           | A <i>Ledbetter v. Goodyear Tire &amp; Rubber Co.</i>                                                                                            | 231 |
|           | B Maternity Protection Convention, 2000 (No. 183)                                                                                               | 234 |
|           | C <i>Case of the Employees of the Fireworks Factory of Santo Antônio de Jesus v. Brazil</i>                                                     | 236 |
|           | D Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                     | 239 |
| IV        | Food, water security, and health                                                                                                                | 243 |
|           | A <i>Women's Rights and the Right to Food</i>                                                                                                   | 244 |
|           | B Guidelines on the Right to Water in Africa                                                                                                    | 246 |
|           | C Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                     | 247 |
|           | Note: Human rights related to menstruation                                                                                                      | 250 |
| V         | Conclusions: Women and access to resources                                                                                                      | 251 |
| <b>10</b> | <b>Women, the environment, and climate change</b>                                                                                               | 252 |
| I         | Introduction: Examining environmental law issues with a gender and human rights lens                                                            | 252 |
| II        | The right to a safe and healthy environment                                                                                                     | 254 |

|           |                                                                                                                                                                                              |            |
|-----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| A         | Report of the Special Rapporteur on the issue of human rights obligations relating to the enjoyment of a safe, clean, healthy and sustainable environment, John H. Knox                      | 255        |
| B         | The Environment and Human Rights, Inter-American Court of Human Rights                                                                                                                       | 258        |
| C         | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                    | 260        |
| III       | The effects of climate change on women                                                                                                                                                       | 264        |
| A         | Gender-Related Dimensions of Disaster Risk Reduction in the Context of Climate Change                                                                                                        | 266        |
| B         | Rosa Celorio, <i>Several Steps Forward, One Backward: Climate Change, Latin America, and Human Rights Resilience</i> , MARYLAND JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW                                 | 268        |
| C         | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                    | 270        |
| IV        | Conclusions: Advocacy on human rights, women, and the environment                                                                                                                            | 275        |
| <b>11</b> | <b>Women and the regional human rights protection systems</b>                                                                                                                                | <b>277</b> |
| I         | Introduction: The relationship between the universal and regional human rights protection systems: the situation of women                                                                    | 277        |
| II        | Inter-American system of human rights                                                                                                                                                        | 278        |
| A         | <i>Maria da Penha Maia Fernandez</i>                                                                                                                                                         | 279        |
| B         | <i>Case of Guzmán Albarracín et al. v. Ecuador</i>                                                                                                                                           | 281        |
| C         | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                    | 283        |
| III       | European system of human rights                                                                                                                                                              | 286        |
| A         | <i>MC v. Bulgaria</i> , European Court of Human Rights                                                                                                                                       | 287        |
| B         | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                    | 289        |
| IV        | African system of human rights                                                                                                                                                               | 293        |
| A         | General Comment No. 2 on Article 14.1.a), (b), (c), and (f) and Article 14.2.a) and (c) of the Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa | 294        |
| B         | <i>APDF and IHRDA v. Republic of Mali</i> , African Court of Human Rights                                                                                                                    | 296        |
| C         | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                    | 297        |
| D         | Practical exercise: Democracy and human rights                                                                                                                                               | 299        |
| V         | Other regional human rights approaches                                                                                                                                                       | 299        |
| A         | Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women in the ASEAN Region                                                                                                                 | 300        |
| B         | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                    | 302        |
| VI        | Conclusions: Regional adaptation to the new problems faced by women                                                                                                                          | 303        |
| <b>12</b> | <b>Women, culture, and religion</b>                                                                                                                                                          | <b>305</b> |
| I         | Introduction: Reconciling the rights of women, culture, and religion                                                                                                                         | 305        |
| II        | The complex relationship between women and religion                                                                                                                                          | 306        |

|              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |            |
|--------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| A            | Report of the Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief, Ahmed Shaheed, <i>Gender-based violence and discrimination in the name of religion or belief</i>                                                       | 307        |
| B            | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 309        |
| C            | Practical exercise: Religion and women                                                                                                                                                                                    | 312        |
| III          | Religious wear from a human rights perspective                                                                                                                                                                            | 313        |
| A            | European Court of Human Rights, <i>Leyla Şahin v. Turkey</i>                                                                                                                                                              | 313        |
| B            | <i>Matter of Sonia Yaker</i> , United Nations Human Rights Committee                                                                                                                                                      | 316        |
| C            | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 319        |
| IV           | Women and culture                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 320        |
| A            | Report of the Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights, Farida Shaheed, <i>Enjoyment of cultural rights of women on an equal basis with men</i>                                                                 | 321        |
| B            | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 323        |
| V            | Conclusions: Culture and religion as key to the human rights of women                                                                                                                                                     | 324        |
| <b>13</b>    | <b>The human rights of women in the digital world</b>                                                                                                                                                                     | <b>326</b> |
| I            | Introduction: The gender digital divide                                                                                                                                                                                   | 326        |
| II           | Violence against women online                                                                                                                                                                                             | 327        |
| A            | Louise Arimatsu, <i>Silencing Women in the Digital Age</i>                                                                                                                                                                | 327        |
| B            | Report of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences, Dubravka Šimonović, <i>Online violence against women and girls from a human rights perspective</i>                               | 329        |
| C            | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 333        |
| III          | Access to and use of technology                                                                                                                                                                                           | 335        |
| A            | Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, <i>Bridging the Digital Divide: Include, Upskill, and Innovate</i> (2018), pp. 22–24                                                                              | 335        |
| B            | Laura J. Dixon, Teresa Correa, Joseph Straubhaar, Laura Covarrubias, Dean Graber, Jeremiah Spence, Viviana Rojas, <i>Gendered Space: The Digital Divide between Male and Female Users in Internet Public Access Sites</i> | 337        |
| C            | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 339        |
| IV           | The right to privacy                                                                                                                                                                                                      | 341        |
| A            | Right to Privacy                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 341        |
| B            | <i>Copland v. United Kingdom</i>                                                                                                                                                                                          | 344        |
| C            | Reflections and Questions                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 345        |
| V            | Conclusions: Technology as a facilitator to the exercise of women's rights                                                                                                                                                | 346        |
| <i>Index</i> |                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 348        |