Women in Mexican Subnational Legislatures

From Descriptive to Substantive Representation
Acknowledgments

Hernández, Cynthia Daniela Velázquez Garcés, Arturo Peralta Oliver, Lizbeth Jocelyn Medina Islas, Yazmin Patricia Noris Contreras, María José Lorenzo, Abril Alejandra Talavera Hidalgo, Brenda Lizeth González Arias, Jesús David Granados Aviés, Abraham Pacheco Rivas, and Eugenio José Mora Zamora. The authors also thank Bruno Fisz and Adrian Albala, editors responsible for Springer’s book series on Latin American Societies Current Challenges in Social Sciences, for their enthusiasm with the book project since its very beginning as well as Srividya Subramanian for the work done in the care and editing of this book.

We are convinced that democracies without women are not democracies. It is our tribute to so many maestras feministas (feminist masters), women politicians, activists, and women’s rights advocates who fight every day to break down the obstacles women face when they want to exercise power.

Mexico City, November 30, 2021

Contents

1 Introduction ............................................. 1
  1.1 Research ............................................. 4
  1.2 Plan of the Book ....................................... 6
  References ................................................ 10

2 They Have the Seats, But Not the Power: The Argument ........ 15
  2.1 Political Representation: A Multifaceted Conundrum ........ 15
  2.2 Institutions, Feminist Neo-institutionalism, and Gender Representation ............................................. 20
  2.3 Understanding Women’s Legislative Representation: Dimensions of Analysis ............................................. 25
    2.3.1 The Formal Dimension of Legislative Representation .... 27
    2.3.2 The Descriptive Dimension of Legislative Representation .... 30
    2.3.3 The Symbolic Dimension of Legislative Representation .... 32
    2.3.4 The Substantive Dimension of Legislative Representation .... 36
  2.4 Factors Explaining Women’s Political Representation ........ 39
    2.4.1 Political-Institutional Variables ........................ 39
    2.4.2 Socioeconomic Variables ............................. 41
    2.4.3 Attitudinal Variables ............................. 42
    2.4.4 Variables of the Representation (Interactions Between the Dimensions of the Representation) ........ 44
  2.5 Methodology: Proposals for Measuring and Explaining Political Representation from a Multidimensional Perspective ........ 47
    2.5.1 Case Selection .................................... 47
    2.5.2 Objectives, Questions, Method, Hypotheses, and Data .... 47
  2.6 Argument and Contribution ................................ 52
  References ................................................ 55

3 The Long and Winding Road to Gender Parity in Mexican Congresses ............................................. 67
  3.1 All Politics Is Local! .................................... 67
3.2 A Thorny Path: The Evolution of the Federal Gender Electoral Regime in Mexico ........................................ 76
3.3 Advances and Setbacks in the Construction of the Gender Electoral Regime in the Mexican States ......................... 81
3.4 Multilevel, Multi-Stakeholder, and Multi Strategic: Parity in Mexican Congresses ............................................. 86
References ........................................................................... 87

4 Why Do Some State Congresses Have More Female Legislators than Others? ....................................................... 93
4.1 The Descriptive Dimension of Women’s Representation at the Subnational Level ................................................. 93
4.2 Methodological Decisions .................................................. 95
4.3 Women’s Presence in State Legislatures ............................ 101
4.4 Parity Legislatures: More Women in Subnational Congresses ........................................................................ 104
4.5 Resistance to Women’s Descriptive Representation ............ 105
4.5.1 Political Parties as Gatekeepers of Women’s Participation .......................................................... 106
4.5.2 Money Ceilings ................................................................ 109
4.5.3 Sexist Coverage, Double Standards, Gender Stereotypes, and Discrimination in Electoral Campaigns ................. 110
4.6 Models ................................................................................. 113
4.7 It Is the Rules! ........................................................................ 119
References ............................................................................. 120

5 How Do Women Exercise the Legislative Function? .......... 123
5.1 The Symbolic Dimension of Women’s Representation in Subnational Legislatures ............................................... 123
5.2 Methodological Decisions .................................................. 127
5.3 The Participation of Female Legislators in Leadership Positions in Subnational Congresses .................................. 130
5.4 The Participation of Female Legislators in Legislative Commissions ..................................................................... 135
5.5 Internal Dynamics: Language, Units, and Specialized Bodies ............................................................................ 138
5.6 Resistance to Women’s Symbolic Representation ............... 143
5.6.1 Gendered Institutions ..................................................... 142
5.6.2 Lack of Legislative Experience ...................................... 144
5.6.3 Gender Stereotypes, Sexism, Double Standards, and Discrimination .................................................. 145
5.6.4 Little Support from Political Parties for Female Legislators’ Work ......................................................... 146
5.7 Models ................................................................................. 148
5.8 It Is the Descriptive Representation! .................................... 152
References ............................................................................. 155

6 How and Why........................................................................ 93
6.1 The Subnational Representation ........................................... 93
6.2 Mexico .............................................................................. 96
6.3 The Legislative Process ..................................................... 98
6.4 Articulatingobarriersto Women’s Participation .................. 100
6.5 Resistance .......................................................................... 103
6.6 Resistance to Women’s Descriptive Representation ............ 104
6.6.1 Lack of Female Candidates ........................................... 105
6.6.2 Lack of Female Leadership Positions............................ 107
6.6.3 Stereotypes, Sexism, Double Standards, and Discrimination in the Legislative Process ............................. 108
6.7 Models ................................................................................. 110
6.8 It Is the Rules! ........................................................................ 114
References ............................................................................. 120

7 Conclusions ........................................................................ 123
7.1 The Revolution ................................................................. 123
7.2 From Inclusion to Participation ........................................... 124
7.3 The Multiplicity of Challenges .......................................... 125
7.4 Rethinking Women’s Participation ..................................... 126
7.5 Pending Post-Revolutional Challenges ............................... 127
7.6 Future Research ............................................................... 128
References ............................................................................. 130

Annex 1 .......................................................... 130
Annex 2 .......................................................... 130
Annex 3 .......................................................... 130
Annex 4 .......................................................... 130
Index ..................................................................................... 130


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6</th>
<th>How and Whom Do Women Represent in Legislatures?</th>
<th>159</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>The Substantive Dimension of Women's Legislative Representation at the Subnational Level</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Methodological Decisions</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>The Legislative Activity of Mexican Congresses: An Overview</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Articulation of Interests: Legislative Proposals</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Realization of Interests: Bills-Approved</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Resistance to Women's Substantive Representation</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1</td>
<td>Lack of a Progressive Gender Agenda and Feminist Ideology Among Women Representatives</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2</td>
<td>Lack of Collaboration and Stereotyped Sexist Coverage of Women's Leadership</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Models</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>It is to Have Seats and to Have Power!</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>195</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7</th>
<th>Conclusions</th>
<th>199</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>The Revolution of Presence</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>From Inclusion to Influence: Women as Intruders</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>The Multidimensionality of Political Representation</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Rethinking Representation</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Pending Political Strategies: The New Political and Social Pact</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>Future Research Agendas</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>221</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Annex 1 | 225 |
| Annex 2 | 229 |
| Annex 3 | 233 |
| Annex 4 | 239 |

Index | 243 |